

181st ANNUAL CONGREGATION MEETING Tuesday, May 23, 2023

The meeting began at 7:00PM in the 5th Floor Chapel and was made available via Zoom.

Cantor Shayna De Lowe (CDL) led a niggun.

Peter Ehrenberg (PE) welcomed the congregation and made his opening remarks. He noted that the meeting was being conducted as a hybrid meeting, with members both participating in person and over Zoom and with Barbara Zakin (BZ) monitoring the chat portion of the Zoom meeting. He noted that, for those participating remotely, objections must be entered into the chat so BZ could let the group know that an objection was raised. Anyone participating remotely who does not enter an objection in the chat would be treated as voting affirmatively. Those members participating in person would have the opportunity to vote by raising their hands.

PE then called the meeting to order. He asked BZ to confirm that a quorum had been reached and she did so.

PE then asked **Rabbi Deborah Goldberg (RDG) and Rabbi Mira Weller (RMW)to do the invocation, which RDG and RMW did.**

PE then asked for a motion to waive the reading of last year's minutes and to approve those minutes. The motion was made and seconded. PE asked all those objecting to please raise their hands or signify their objection in the chat; seeing no objections, **the motion was approved**.

PE then made remarks:

Since my 3-year term as president will come to an end after tonight, I'd like to spend a few minutes looking back at our collective journey over the last 3 years. I recall where we were 3 years ago:

- Our synagogue doors were closed we couldn't enter the sanctuary for services. If you recall
 watching Rabbi Levine, Rabbi Spratt, Rabbi Weitzman, Cantor Garfein and Cantor De Lowe lead
 services from their homes. We were in the synagogue, perhaps not physically but
 inspirationally.
- And then there was our **very first entirely remote High Holy Days**. The clergy and staff worked so hard in the heat of August. On Erev Rosh Hashanah, we learned Judge Ruth Bader Ginsberg

had died. We learned how to operate a synagogue remotely, though not easy, I thank the staff for all they did to keep us operating.

- Rodeph Sholom School set a goal to open their doors in August of that year, and they did it. The last 3 years saw a big movement of people leaving the city and moving to the suburbs, threatening our membership base.
- But our membership base stayed stable in part due to a cohort of 20 and 30 year olds, who have become so interested in our synagogue. Thank you, Rabbi Goldberg for all you are doing to keep and grow that group.
- Over the past 3 years we have seen an incredible transition in the composition of our clergy. When do you ever get to see an installation of a senior Cantor and Rabbi at the same time, while also adding 3 other members of our clergy, Rabbi Goldberg, Rabbi Weller, and Cantor lacono, which was quite an achievement for our synagogue.

During the last 3 years we embarked on a **listening campaign**, our goal was to listen to our members and hear their pleasure and pain points. We learned that our members strive for connection, it wasn't a surprise, but it was important to hear. In addition to this campaign to listen, we undertook a membership survey and again saw the need for connection.

We moved next to **the development of a strategic plan**. This was the first time that our synagogue went through a full strategic planning process. Through that process we've articulated a new mission statement that was on the screen at the beginning of this meeting.

We have identified 4 basic goals:

- To nourish mind, body and soul across all life stages
- To cultivate community and connection
- To activate members as community creators
- To assure that our organizational infrastructure enables the realization of our strategic goals

Our strategic plan will look out over a 5 year horizon starting with a budget we will vote on this evening. Part and Parcel of that budget is

A new CRM system: Customer (Congregant) Relationship Management system. This gives us
the ability to get at our data. This, to understand when our members come; to what events;
this, to be smarter about ourselves; it will streamline information for our staff once we are able
to implement this system.

We have come a long way in 3 years. I want to thank those who got us there:

- First I want to **thank the Clergy**. They continue to lead us; to inspire us; to challenge us; and to embrace us. When I began my tenure as president, I was worried that something was going to happen to me between me and the clergy, because now I'll see how the sausage gets made. But I needn't have worried, because every day, you continue to inspire me, and I'm so grateful for that.
- Second, I want to thank the **Staff of both CRS and RSS lead by BZ and Danny Karp (DK)**. Our staffs show day in and day out their complete dedication to our institutions. Ironically, for many of them, when they are doing their jobs the best, we see them the least. And so, those on the staff who are here, would you please stand up so we can thank you with applause.
- Of course I want to thank **our board including all of our officers** for all the work that they have done. Sometimes I wonder how they can have a life outside of they synagogue given all that we ask them to do.
- There is a short story by Herman Melville called "Bartleby, the Scrivener". Please don't tell anyone on the board about this story because what Bartleby always does is he says "I prefer not to" when anybody asks him to do anything. Our board doesn't react that way.
- Finally I want to **thank our congregants** for all the support you have given for the last 3 years. **You've supported us in dollars both in dues and the annual appeal**. And you have supported us with your presence. Online, in meetings, in schools and in our sanctuary.
- If you are member of our clergy, staff or CRS or RSS, if you are a member or former member of the board, or you are a congregant- thank you. You are all in my heart where you will remain. You inspire me as you have done each and every day over the last 3 years.

In our liturgy, we know Moses led us out of Egypt, he never quite made it to the promised land. We learn from that that for each generation, the goal is to enable the next generation to strive even further.

As we turn this presidency over to Stacy Kanter later tonight, I could not be more excited about the future of our synagogue. Under Stacy's leadership I have no doubt that we will continue to prosper, inspire, and that we will continue to be pursuers of peace through prayer, education and service to our community.

Thank you CRS for allowing me to work on your behalf for the last 3 years. I'm not done yet with my service to this extraordinary community, But happily can turn over the mantal of the presidency to Stacy to continue what so many before me have done. As I said on Kol Nidrei, we stand on the shoulders of those who came before us looking forward to what hopefully will be a wonderful future.

PE than asks Judy Gallent (JG) to present the Roof Transformation Project

I have to go off script to thank Peter for his unbelievable dedication and tireless efforts on behalf of our community.

I'm here to talk about the transformation of our roof

Our roof:

- It consists of the main roof; also called the 7th floor; and the surface of the 6th floor terrace; as well as setback roofs that you don't see, but they exist and they leak. It is more than 20 years old and it has outlived its usefulness. It has to be replaced, we've seen evidence of leaks.
- It may seem like a mundane maintenance project, but it provides us a wonderful opportunity to reimagine these spaces to **reflect our values by incorporating the principles of sustainability** into the project and to provide enhanced outdoor space that we have learned is so critical in this post covid reality that we live in.
- With the help of **MBB Architects** we are not just replacing the roof membrane to provide a watertight cover for our beloved building. But we 're transforming the 7th floor or main roof into a green roof with solar panels.
 - The solar panel system will produce electricity that has potential to offset over 30% of our electricity costs saving us money and reducing our carbon footprint.
 - The **green roof** will capture storm water reducing the demand on the city's strained and overburdened, combined sewer overflow system.
 - In addition we will be updating the insulation beneath the roof membrane, which will reduce the energy we need to heat and cool the building also lowering our utility bills and shrinking our carbon footprint.
 - These sustainability improvements will allow us to be a model of tikkun olam an environmental stewardship not only for our congregation but for the broader community.
- Work on the main roof has begun and we expect to have it finished, including the sustainability improvements, by the end of October.

Replacing the 6th floor roofing

• Requires the **removal of a somewhat beloved but aging play structure** that many of you know is used by the nursery school and the Rodeph Sholom Camp

- But this gives us an opportunity to create an **enhanced outdoor worship and event spac**e as well as a reimagined playscape for our littlest ones.
- The **event space** will feature built-in bench seating for 120 people.
 - Non-petroleum based artificial turf created from sustainable materials and for those who need to know it's made of soy and sugar.
 - A retractable awning to provide shade and some rain protection, it wont' be an all weather space.
 - o It will have landscaping, lighting and custom play equipment.

Here you can see the **2 distinct zones** that will be created on the 6th floor

- The play space will be on the eastern side of the roof and
- The event space will be on the western side of the roof.
- In addition to the built in seating for the 120 there will be a large open space that can be used for various configurations of worship events and also can be rented for other events. Cocktail parties and receptions of many kinds.

Our plan is to start the 6th floor work in December and work through the winter months when that space is least used and hopefully have it ready in late March for the spring season.

The **total cost** of the project which is inclusive of both the 6th and 7th floors as well as all the sustainability upgrades, is 4 million dollars of which we have raised more than **2.5 million** to date in generous gifts and we expect to raise the balance through additional fund raising efforts.

PE then asked Treasurer Stacy Kanter (SK) to present the FY23 Budget Report.

SK then presented the Treasurer remarks.

SK thanked PE and acknowledged that this is her last report as treasurer, acknowledges Marc Fried. He looks out for us from a risk perspective, he knows everything, and he has been incredibly helpful, I appreciate you every year and will continue to.

SK is pleased to present the FY 2024 budget for approval by the congregation tonight. I'm going to ask that all questions be held till the end. We will monitor the room and monitor the chat and will get back to them.

SK noted that last year we delivered a balanced budget for FY23 which ends on June 30

With thanks to the Congregation for a second record-breaking Annual Appeal, we are projecting an FY23 surplus of \$745,000 and that's for the synagogue. That's partly because we are still benefiting from the pandemic relief PPP loans that we got and that were forgiven.

There's a second part of that, while we had budgeted to use the full surplus in FY23 our expenses were lower because there were a number of positions that remained unfilled as a result of challenging labor

markets. Our staff works incredibly hard and this is not the way that we want to be creating surpluses. So we hope to be able to fill these positions going forward. Despite securities markets declines and volatility our operating and capital reserves are above their targets and those reserves along with the various funds are positioned to support our operating budget in 2024 and beyond.

When I say beyond it's with the exception of the seed money and that's because the seed money was what was created from our capital campaign and it has supported through it's development for 7 years, this is an incredibly important program and we will continue the program but we will no longer benefit from that fund.

So now I'll turn to **FY24. We are seeking approval of a balanced budget that**, as I say every year, reflects our values and our priorities, it is who we are.

On the revenue side we assume that membership units remain constant at 1670 and that's after 2 years, as Peter alluded to, of record numbers of new members. And we've assumed a 4% increase in membership dues as well as an increase in tuition for Discoveries (formerly Religious School). You'll remember that we did not increase our dues for FY21 or FY22 as a result of the pandemic. But during that period, our expenses continued to increase.

In our Fiscal 24 budget, our dues account for 49% of our budget. So, other sources of revenue, including our annual appeal and other giving are critical. For budgeting purposes, we have assumed a 4% reduction from the current year's annual appeal, to be somewhat conservative, but it is certainly not our goal to have a decrease in the annual appeal. The budget also assumes draws from the earnings from our Foundation Fund, operating and in capital reserves and Perpetual Care Fund, as well as principal draws from the Foundation Fund and the capital reserve fund for the CRM, the implementation of our strategic plan and, together with the fundraising, that Judy mentioned, our capital budget. And from the accessibility fund and seed money. And finally we've used the surplus that I've referred to, the FY23 Surplus of \$745,000 to balance the FY24 budget. Turning to the expense side, our budget reflects robust programming, and includes investment in our first year of our 5 year strategic plan.

People continue to reflect and represent roughly 80% of our expenses. Our employees, just like all of us are impacted by inflation, and we had to take inflation into account in considering the compensation of our treasured staff and clergy, as well as the dues and tuition increases I mentioned. We've budgeted clergy and staff salary increases and additional support for our clergy, membership and business office. We will fill the positions that were left open because of the market last year and there are also some additional positions that we are going to be including.

Finally, we've included a 2% contingency. It's a buffer and is still higher than the 1% pre-pandemic contingencies. We remain focused on the financial and other challenges ahead of us, which include: increasing salary and benefit expenses; necessary capital expenditures, both here in this building and at the cemetery; demographic changes on the Upper West Side, in our city and in our world; and the sustainability of our current dues and cost structure.

Tonight we seek approval of the consolidated CRS budget for FY24 which includes the Rodeph Sholom School. The synagogue budget has been approved by the budget committee and the Board of Trustees. The RSS budget has been approved by the RSS finance committee and its Board of Directors.

SK opens the floor for Questions:

Audience Question: Last year we were concerned about the removal of certain pension plan funding. Can you explain that to me, that was very painful for me. So I'm wondering given that we have a surplus by the various items. I don't have these financial terms.

SK Responded: This year we have full pensions included, and last year we included most of the pensions. It was painful, it is painful for all of us that we did not make up the freezes in FY21 and FY22. It is certainly one of the factors that we considered in looking at the raises that we implemented this last year and this year most raises are around 4-6% so we are trying to keep that in mind as well as inflation.

Audience Question: Does this wonderful capital campaign to improve the roof system with the solar panels and the green roof and everything get the building out of its D energy rating, and to the place we need to be so that we are not penalized by the city?

SK Responded: We are certainly hopeful that it will get us out from the D rating that we all cringe from. As Judy mentioned, it does a lot in terms of our carbon footprint. It's living our values. Judy do you want to add anything?

JG Responded: I failed to mention that part of the funds will go to doing an energy audit. There is no expectation the D will be changed just on the basis of the solar panel implementation; these are important steps.

SK: The budgeted revenue for FY24 for CRS Including RSS is \$37.6 Million dollars which includes the carryover of surpluses from FY23 of about \$1.6 Million for both the synagogue and the school.

<u>Budgeted expenses</u> are approximately **\$37.6 Million including approximately a \$640,000 contingency**. Budgeted capital expenditures of about \$4.5 Million dollars including the roof and CRM Projects resulting in a balanced budget for FY23.

PE asked for a motion to approve the FY24 CRS budget. The motion was made and seconded. PE asked anyone objecting to please raise their hands or signify their objection in the chat; seeing no objections, the FY24 was approved by the members of the congregation. PE called on SK to discuss amended bylaws.

SK Bylaws: Last year we formed a taskforce to consider changes to our governance that reflect the current views of good governance in not for profits and the corporate space and in general. There's been an increase in focus in governance on transparency on issues along those lines. We also formed the task force in light of feedback that we received from our own board through our annual

self evaluation. The work of the governance taskforce included a review of our bylaws, and it resulted in the amendments that we are seeking approval of tonight. The **proposed amendments have been posted on the website** on the landing page for the meeting. They have been approved by the Board of Trustees after the governance taskforce made a recommendation to the board.

In order for them to become effective, they require the approval of the congregation.

- The amendments are intended to **modernize** our governance.
- They will expand opportunities for leadership. Both for current trustees and for congregants more broadly and enhance diversity by shortening term limits for the President, Chair of the Board, Trustees, Officers, and Nominating Committee Chair.
- They also **expand the pool of trustees** who may serve in certain leadership positions.
- Another goal of the amendments is to have board actions increasingly taken by the full board
 rather than our executive committee, which is empowered to manage the operations of the
 synagogue between board meetings.
- And finally, we are excited to create a new Emeritus board which all of our former trustees will be invited to join to continue to share their wisdom and their experience and provide advice and guidance to the board.

This will be different from our current structure which has Honoraries attending board meetings and other former trustees on the Presidents Council that we formed. So all of the former trustees will meet and be engaged together. SK asks if anyone in the room or in the chat has any questions.

PE asks for motion to approve the amended bylaws. The motion was made and seconded. PE asked all those objecting to please raise their hands or signify their objection in the chat; seeing no objections, the FY23 was approved by the members of the congregation.

PE calls on Martin Flumenbaum (MF) to present the nominees.

MF Gives thanks to Peter. Thanks also to the nominating committee. This is a unique committee of trustees and non-trustees. They worked exceptionally hard to bring forward 4 new candidates for the board this year. We have also had the privilege and pleasure of determining the nominee for the Presidency. We have the honor of nominating someone who is a fitting successor to Peter, who will take us to the next level and we are all excited about the exceptional Stacy Kanter.

The **nominating committee** has done exceptional work. It's a 7-person committee including **Jeff Ravetz**; **Jason Bruck**; **Scott Bernstein**; **Lisa Pruzan**; **Jackie Weiss**; **Lucy Lang and myself**. They interviewed people, created a pipeline for the future, and recommended the following slate of Officers and Trustees.

Martin Flumenbaum (MF) noted that the following Officers were nominated to serve for one-year terms ending in June 2025.

Stacy Kanter – President Eileen Kleinman– Treasurer Judy Gallent – Assistant Treasurer

Scott Bernstein – Vice President

Cara Lown – Vice President

Annette Orenstein – Vice President

Suzanne Waltman – Vice President

Rob Steinman – Co-Chair of the CRS Board of Trustees

Peter Ehrenberg – Co-Chair of Board of Trustees

MF reported that the returning Trustees nominated to serve for a three-year term ending in 2026 were:

Brian Perman Jeff Ravetz Beth Rubin

MF further reported that new Trustees nominated to serve for a three-year term ending in 2026 were:

Steven Cooper Eric Mogelof Joshua Rothstein Erika Weinberg

PE asked that Nominating Committee members introduce the nominees prior to the vote.

Jeff Ravetz (JR) introduced nominee Steven Cooper (SC).

Jeff Ravetz (JR) introduced Eric Mogelof (EM).

Jason Bruck (JB) introduced Joshua Rothstein (JR).

Jackie Weiss (JW) introduced Erika Weinberg (EW).

PE asked for a motion to approve the nominations as presented by Marty Flumenbaum and as recommended by the Nominating Committee. The motion was made and seconded. PE asked all those objecting to please raise their hands or signify their objection in the chat; seeing no objections, the motion was approved.

PE asked that the four new Trustees come to the front and for a clergy blessing of the new Trustees.

PE asked Rabbi Ben Spratt (RBS) and Cantor Shayna De Lowe (CDL) to come up for this blessing.

Rabbi (BHS) and (SDL) came to the reading table to present a Memorial to the Departed:

PE introduces Stacy Kanter: PE says he is so looking forward to this moment: Stacy, it has been an extraordinary pleasure to work with you for the last 3 years. We will go over your accomplishments. But you have been there as a right hand for me for the full 3 years. As I've said to you, I hope that all of us can do the same for you, I certainly will raise my hand for you. You are a superstar in so many ways. You and Eric were married in the sanctuary in 1987 by Rabbi Hirschberg. Both of your children went to RSS, you've been on the board of RSS. You've helped work on the task force that put together the rules by which the synagogue and RSS work together. You have been the Assistant Treasurer as well as the Treasurer. You've led two brilliant Rabbinic searches for which we greatly appreciate it. I know that everyone will join me in welcoming you and supporting you and hopefully hearing you accept this new position:

SK I do. So here I am once again with a new hat. But with the same heart and same love for our congregation.

- Peter, thank you for your words, friendship and not to pile on or anything, but for the selfless and collaborative leadership you have demonstrated these last 3 years, notwithstanding the challenges and the changes. You struck the delicate balance of honoring our legacy, managing unprecedented risks and planning for the future.
- Marty, I want to thank you and the whole nominating committee. You have always been a tremendous support for me, I appreciate your words and I appreciate you. To our entire community, thank you for entrusting me with our mission, our vision and our future.

I've done a lot of thinking for the last couple of weeks leading up to this. I think about my own introduction to Rodeph sholom. It was more than 35 years ago and Eric and I wanted to find a Manhattan synagogue in which to be married. The walk from the subway took me through an area that was completely unfamiliar to me. But those steps between our now home at 82nd and Broadway, the school and synagogue at 83rd and 84th, and the school on 78/79th became our village.

I remember my first thought as I came to look at the synagogue, and I walked into the majestic sanctuary. I looked to the bimah. I thought, there is no way I am walking down that aisle. I will sneak in at the front. We were looking for a wedding venue. But Rabbi Hirschberg embraced us and made sure we found a home. Standing under the chuppah listening to Rabbi Hirschberg, I remember thinking to myself, Eric must have had an additional conversation with him without me. His words were so on point for a couple that he had only just recently met. But he saw us and understood us. Dear clergy, thankfully some things do not change.

We recently had the joy of Rabbi Spratt and Cantor De Lowe marrying our son Jonathan and now daughter Erin. And Jon and Erin signing their ketubah on the same bimah, and Erin being part of the recent strategic planning process. In the blink of an eye, we are one of those multigenerational families. The congregation has been a family affair for us. My sister Leslie and Roland, became members soon after they were married, long before our embrace of multifaith couples evolved to

where it is today. And the four children between us made the Rodeph Sholom School a true center of our lives.

The school left indelible marks on the people our sons, Jonathan and Sam, have become. And importantly on Eric and me as parents in the Rodeph Sholom community. You don't forget when each of your 3 year old sons comes home on a Friday and asks, Aren't we going to have Shabbat? Or after a night at the shelter, they ask, why the men in the shelter are homeless as they defied all stereotypes. Eventually Eric served on the school board and the synagogue board of trustees, then I did. We and our kids have formed some of our most important friendships, and our beloved clergy have taught us, challenged us, celebrated and mourned with us as they do for our entire community.

- Looking to the future, as a congregation we will continue to live our Jewish values at a time of extraordinary opportunity and with **Rabbi Spratt's visionary leadership**.
- We will **execute the strategic goals** that Peter described. All of this is critical to our continuing to thrive and become increasingly relevant as attitudes generally towards synagogue membership change.
- We are all so focused on ensuring that the **synagogue** is accessible for all who want to be part of our community.
- As you heard from Peter and Judy, we will be making important investment in infrastructure.
 Our roof our new CRM.
- We will **continue to provide a diversity of programming** to engage us across life stages, different family compositions and interests.
- We want CRS to be a place that addresses more of our members' needs.
- Also, where each of us feels that we belong.

When we speak of the synagogue, words like community, welcome and inclusive have long come to mind. To me, the sense of belonging goes further.

It's how we feel walking into the lobby, in services, as a new RSS parent. Being part of a minyan, joining a committee or taking on a leadership role.

It's that feeling that it's ours. One way for us to develop connections and contribute to that sense of belonging is to share our stories with each other, which is one of the reasons I'm sharing mine. I look forward to expanding my own relationships within the congregation.

There's an email address <u>president@crsnyc.org.</u> I really hope it can provide an opportunity for two way communication and help begin some important conversations. I feel strongly that legacy and history can and must live alongside transformation and evolution. They complement each other and

they will inform how I lead. As I begin this next step in my own Rodeph Sholom journey, I do it as part of an extraordinary team.

I am grateful that we continue to benefit from ongoing leadership of **past presidents**, **Jack Levitt**, **Mark Biderman**, **Nancy Solomon**, **Roger Meltzer**, **Karen Berman**, **Marty**, **Rob Steinman and Peter**. And that Rob and Peter will be chairs of our board.

Generations of leaders before us ensured that the congregation can be a meaningful part of our lives. The sacred partnership among our **committed officers**, **Board of Trustees**, **our amazing staff**, **led by Barbara Zakin**, **and our inspiring and indefatigable clergy team** lead by Rabbi Spratt and Cantor De Lowe. Will enable us to do the same for future generations.

I want to express my gratitude to **Rabbi Levine** for what he has meant to our family and our community. And several years ago, he was the first person that suggested to me, that I could be president. I am also grateful to him for his mentorship of our clergy team. Finally, I know I have, and am always grateful for the love and support of my family. Eric, Jon, Sam, Erin and my mother, and my sister Leslie, who has assured me that she is perfecting her first sister wave.

As we prepare to celebrate Shavuot at the end of this week and the giving of Torah on Sinai, may we all live our own torah. May we go from strength to strength and may we, a people and a congregation of acts, of deeds, continue to repair our world. Thank you.

PE: Thank you, Stacy, at this point I would like to call on Rabbi Spratt (BHS) and CDL to conduct the memorial for the departed:

Rabbi Ben Spratt (BHS) and Cantor Shayna De Lowe (SDL) came to the reading table to present a Memorial to the Departed:

Lawrence Epstein
Denise Goldman
Boris Shlomm
Barbara Gale - Packer
Carole Tain Soskin
Herbert Rothschild
John Lee Kapner
Walter Hess
Elaine Silbert
Diane Bornstein
Daniel Schechter
Sharon Casdin
Louise Weisbord

PE asks for someone other than a member of the Board of Trustees to make the following motion. Resolve that all actions taken by the board since the last annual meeting of members, including all actions taken by the executive committee and nominating committee and each of such actions hereby is approved and ratified.

The motion was made and approved by the congregation..

PE called on Rabbi Juli Karol (JK) and Rabbi Deborah Goldberg (DG) for the benediction.

JK and DG delivered the benediction.

The 181st Annual Meeting of Congregation Rodeph Sholom was adjourned.